Editor
Prof. P. K. Shajahan Ph.D.

Guest Editor
Tehmina Sabuwala.
CONTENTS

Preface

Special Articles
What Should Universal Basic Income Learn From Bolsa Familia? 1
By Tehmina Sabuwala,

Commentary
What They Were? Who They Are? What They Want To Be? 17
By Smita Khanijow

Commentary
A Report of A Campaign on Child Malnutrition 24
By Abid Faheem

Commentary
Coaching in the Social Space 28
By ‘Sumanaharaya’ Gayatri Anandh

News and Events 33
Author Guidelines 35

Regional Cooperation Newsletter – South Asia is an online quarterly newsletter published by the Inter-national Council on Social Welfare – South Asia Region. Currently, it is functioning from the base of the Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai, India.

The content of this newsletter may be freely reproduced or cited provided the source is acknowledged.

The views expressed in this publication are those of the respective author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the policy or position of ICSW
Multiple marginalities of communities and vulnerabilities of populations form the target of Sustainable Development Goals. Unless there are concerted plans to address these marginalities the global aim of “Transforming our world” would remain elusive. Poverty continue to be the first priority from MDGs to SDGs. This essentially means that national governments in particular and global community in general need to evolve policies and action plans to address poverty with targeted outcomes defined. The current issue of the Newsletter has its focus on poverty, homelessness and malnutrition and elaborate some examples of addressing these challenges.

The special article by the Guest Editor, Ms. Tehmina Sabuwala presents the new policy framework by Indian Government in adopting Universal Basic Income as an approach to eliminate poverty effectively. The approach is juxtaposed with the “Bolsa Familia” experiment from Latin America for a critical analysis of the Universal Basic Income approach. The author forewarns that without adequate operational mechanisms in place, replacing welfare schemes by Universal Basic Income could be detrimental to people living in poverty.

The commentary by Smita Khanijow presents the challenges posed by homelessness and its ripple effects on a variety of human rights concerns. By elaborating the state and civil society responses to the issue of homelessness, the author poignantly discusses the specific challenges posed by women in such situations. The article highlights the need for focussed research in the sector with an intersectional perspective to understand and evolve strategies to fight homelessness and its deleterious effect on women.

Mr. Abid Faheem and student of Social Work at the Tata Institute presents a case of a campaign, he along with his fellow student ran to highlight the grim realities of malnutrition among the most marginalised communities in India. The problem highlighted here is not limited to India, but is a global concern and thereby forming the second goal among the 17 SDGs.

Global Action on Poverty (GAP) is global initiative aimed at ending poverty across the globe thought individual and collective action. It believes that small ideas can have significant impacts if the ideas are allowed to blossom and necessary ecosystem of supports are evolved around a changemaker who is committed to impact the situations of poverty in his/her immediate surroundings. The third commentary by ‘Sumanaharaya’ Gayathri Anandh traces her own journey as a coach in supporting changemakers.

I am sure the analysis of the critical developmental concerns of present day society such as poverty, malnutrition and homelessness presented in this issue provides some direction for action. International Council on Social Welfare (ICSW) has its commitment to work towards addressing these concerns through policy practice and direct engagements.

Look forward for a better transformed world with lesser inequality and better opportunities for all.

P.K. Shajahan
31 March 2017
SPECIAL ARTICLE

WHAT SHOULD UNIVERSAL BASIC INCOME LEARN FROM BOLSA FAMILIA?

- Tehmina Sabuwala,

Abstract

In the 2017, end of January in the economic survey government spoke in detail about how Universal Basic Income (UBI) will be implemented all across India. UBI is a scheme where certain amount of income will be provided to all but focusing more on the poor to eradicate poverty. This paper looks at the challenges and advantages of UBI in relation with Public and Target Distribution Systems. It also looks at Bolsa Familia one of the successful cash transfer schemes in Brazil which is similar to UBI to understand what could it learn and adapt from Bolsa Familia scheme.

Poverty Trap in India

The term poverty has assumed multiplicity of meanings in different contexts. At the outset poverty is considered as a multidimensional complex phenomenon which is manifested through the social process. According to Coppedge & Davis (1977) poverty and underdevelopment are inextricably bound in a complex network of socio-economic relationship that historically have defied complete codification and eluded pragmatic and effective policy prescription. Rodgers (1979) explains the dynamics underlying the process of poverty in terms of “inter locking deprivation trap” “syndrome and web of poverty”. He points out that poverty creates mutually reinforcing conditions that handicap and even some times debilitate the poor. Further, Chambers (1983) elaborates the concept of “inter locking deprivation trap” in terms of five clusters of disadvantages in the form of poverty, physical weakness, vulnerability, isolation and powerlessness. Thus these scholars present the unmistakeable impact of poverty on the lives of people who experience it. (Shajahan & Shani, 2016)

Even after three decades of sustained economic growth and a proliferation of welfare schemes, roughly one in three Indians still live below the poverty line, according to the last report on poverty estimates submitted by the Rangarajan committee in 2014. While those estimates have been questioned, the fact remains that there is little dispute over the fact that too many Indians remain trapped in poverty. The persistence of poverty and significant leakages in welfare schemes that aim to alleviate it has prompted many academics and policymakers to explore more efficient alternatives to India’s creaky and leaky welfare architecture. One of the suggestions has been to move towards a “universal basic income”. (Kundu, 2016)

Introduction – Universal Basic Income plans to quickly alleviate poverty

According to Economic Survey report, 2016-17, a universal basic income is, like many rights, unconditional and universal, it requires that every person should have a right to a basic income to cover their needs, just by virtue of being citizens. (Government of India, 2017).

The goal of Universal Basic Income is to promote equality by reducing poverty. It promotes efficiency by reducing waste in government transfers. And it could, under
some circumstances, even promote greater productivity. A Universal Basic Income may simply be the fastest way of reducing poverty. (Government of India, 2017)

**Universal Basic Income is not a new concept it is same old argument of replacing PDS with cash transfer, it is now done with UBI**

Universal Basic Income has been in government’s plan since 2012 (Rajshekhar, 2012). Back in 2008, in an influential paper in the *Economic and Political Weekly* titled ‘The case for direct cash transfers to the poor’, Arvind Subramanian, the present Chief Economic Adviser of the government, along with economists Devesh Kapur and Partha Mukhopadhyay, argued that the ₹1,80,000 crore spent annually on centrally sponsored schemes and assorted subsidies should instead be distributed as cash directly to 70 million households below the poverty line. Put simply, the UBI in India is nothing but the old wine of direct cash transfer in a fancy new bottle. (Sampath, 2017)

Universal Basic Income objective remains the same to eliminate the public distribution system (PDS) and with it, the food, fuel, and fertiliser subsidies. The same old arguments for replacing the PDS with cash transfers are now being trotted out in favour of the UBI. The addition of the word ‘universal’ signals greater ambition but alters neither the substance nor the motive. (Sampath, 2017)

**Amount that will be provided in Universal Basic Income**

Universal basic amount provided to people is not all sufficient and target clear, unlike Brazil Bolsa Familia focuses on specific needs of children education and health. India fails to even thing about the matter.

A UBI is usually discussed in abstract terms. There is now a proposed amount: 7,620 rupees ($113) a year. Equivalent to less than a month’s pay at the minimum wage in a city, it is well short of what anyone might need to lead a life of leisure. But it would cut absolute poverty from 22% to less than 0.5%. (Economist, 2017)

While different numbers have been bandied about, there seems to be a broad consensus around the Tendulkar committee poverty line of ₹33 a day. This works out to a basic income of ₹1,000-₹1,250 a month or ₹12,000-₹15,000 a year. But even this modest figure is estimated to cost 11-12% of the GDP. In contrast, all the government’s subsidies put together account for only 4-4.5% of the GDP. This presents three options: one, the government makes up the deficit through additional tax revenue; two, it limits the fiscal burden by shrinking the UBI coverage from ‘universal’ to those below the poverty line; and three, it further shrinks the amount being doled out. (Sampath, 2017)

Although, the government is aware of its limits the administrative argument however has to be made with some care. While Aadhar is designed to solve the identification problem, it cannot, on its own, solve the targeting problem. (Government of India, 2017)

**To pay the required funds in Universal Basic Income, government wants to replace current schemes with UBI**

The recent economic survey by the Chief Economist, Arvind Subaramanian suggested a UBI in India to replace all
Unlike Bolsa Familia similar cash transfer scheme in Brazil does not replace their current scheme structure. Bolsa Familia is one of the best cash transfer schemes in the world. Later in the article we will be discussing what steps did Bolsa Familia carried out to make cash transfer successful.

Countries like Brazil and China get their cash transfer funds from countries like US and World Bank. Mr Subramanian also provides an outline of how it would be paid for. Crucially, the money would largely come from recycling funds from around 950 existing welfare schemes, including those that offer subsidised food, water, fertiliser and much else besides. Altogether these add up to roughly the 5% of GDP he thinks his version of UBI would cost. Starting such a programme from scratch would take up around half the central government’s annual budget, such is the pitiful state of direct-tax collection in India. (Economist, 2017).

We need to understand the consequences of replacing UBI with existing schemes, if at all UBI fails to provide cash transfer because of lack of funds and weak administrative systems, the effect it would have on the poor would be severe.

**While, the opposition government states it is pure tactic by the government**

According to the CPM leader, the cash transfer is a ploy by the government to dismantle the PDS (Public Distribution System) and systematically reduce subsidies. "This is to cover up for reducing the subsidies. As inflation continues to grow, the value of cash subsidies keeps dropping. That is in effect the most efficient way of reducing subsidies without saying so," (Kumar, 2014)

The reasons Universal Basic Income is good option because of the loopholes present in the current Public Distribution System (PDS).

In India in particular, the case for UBI has been enhanced because of the weakness of existing welfare schemes which are riddled with misallocation, leakages and exclusion of the poor. (Government of India, 2017)

**Corruption is one of the main reasons, beneficiaries do not get their share:**

India is keen in theory to help its poor, but not very good at it in practice. Much of its welfare subsidies ends up in the hands of the relatively rich, who are more likely to make use of air-conditioned trains or cooking gas—or able to bribe the bureaucrats in charge of deciding who deserves subsidies. In-kind benefits are pilfered by middlemen who would find it harder to get at payments made to beneficiaries’ bank accounts. (Economist, 2017)

**Grains stolen by the middlemen**

The paper finds that at an all-India level, 46.7 per cent or 25.9 MMTs of the off-taken grain did not reach the intended PDS beneficiaries in 2011-12. The percent share of total leakage increased with states where greater percent of India’s poor resided (five states: UP, Bihar, MP, Maharashtra and West Bengal, which are home to close to 60% of India’s poor accounted for close to 50% of the total grain leakage in the country in the year 2011-12). (Gulati Ashok; Saini Shweta, 2015)

Waste, Leakages and Diversion The Planning Commission (2008) has estimated how much of the TPDS (Targeted Public...
Distribution Scheme) rice and wheat are leaked en route by first estimating the amount of such grains reported to have been purchased by all household categories – poor and non-poor, with and without ration cards of all types, whether BPL, AAY or above poverty line (APL). These estimates are subsequently compared to data on how much grain is taken off from the Food Corporation of India’s (FCIs) central pool for delivery to the TPDS depots in the states. (Svedberg, 2012)

The Planning Commission (2008) has estimated the leakages at three points in time, the most recent being 2004-05. In this year, consumers are reported to have bought 13.53 million tonnes in the fair price shops (FPSs), out of which 4.6 million tonnes were bought by poor households. In the same year, 29.65 million tonnes of rice and wheat were taken off the central pool for TPDS cardholders, including APL. Hence, more than half (54%) of the grain taken off for the TPDS disappeared before it reached buyers in the FPS. Moreover, the leakages have increased compared to 1993-94 and 1999-2000, and are estimated at 28%. Estimates based on a “small” expenditure survey from 2007-08 suggests that the leakages have declined somewhat, to 43% since 2004-05 (Himanshu and Sen 2011; Khera 2011a), but were still larger than in 1999-2000.5 (When the final household food expenditure data from the 2009-10 NSS become available, it will be possible to gauge the trend more reliably.) (Svedberg, 2012)

The estimated 4.6 million tonnes of TPDS grains purchased by poor households – with and without BPL or AAY ration cards – corresponds to 15.5% of the total off-take of TPDS grains (29.65 million tonnes). This means that for each kg of subsidised grains bought by the poor, the off-take from the central pool was 6.4 kg. This estimate is considerably higher than the 2.4 kg estimate for 2003-04 from the Planning Commission (2005). That about half the TPDS grains is leaked before reaching consumers reflects inefficiency, corruption and theft on a gigantic scale. (Svedberg, 2012)

**Challenges faced if cash transfer is implemented**

**The administrative systems are not ready**

The most articulate opponents to a CT scheme, who would rather see a reformed and (semi-) universal food subsidy system, explicitly argue that the elimination of exclusion errors is their overriding objective. They are not convinced that UID coverage will become universal (or even close to it). They fear that those who, for various reasons, are left out will not have access to many public services (Khera 2009; Drèze 2010; Drèze and Khera 2010; Himanshu and Sen 2011) – including potential cash transfers. The concerns about exclusion errors cannot be dismissed, and even if full UID coverage is accomplished, exclusion can occur due to faulty targeting for eligibility. (Svedberg, 2012)

Evaluations of the pre-1997 PDS, and more recently from Tamil Nadu, find exclusion errors occur even in universal systems. However, the differentiated CT suggested above would include two-thirds of all Indian households; that the one-third of households left out would include many of the desperately poor is difficult to imagine. Another objection is that “it is not clear how transfers of cash to the poor would allow them to buy grains from the open market in times of steep inflation” (Shah 2008: 78). The solution is to index the transfers to the real price of basic food items, which is
technically simple, but politically sensitive. (Svedberg, 2012)

Other sceptics have argued that providing cash rather than tying the transfer to food subsidies may lead to “unwarranted” consumption, such as tobacco and alcohol. (Svedberg, 2012)

**Another challenge is UID card is not enough to open bank account to transfer the money**

The most frequent argument against a CT scheme was valid till a few years back, but no longer. It was argued that in order to receive a transfer, households need not only a unique digitised identity card, but also a bank or a post office account, which about half the rural population in India lacks, according to the National Bank for Agriculture and Rural Development (NABARD). However, such accounts are no longer necessary for being able to receive cash. With modern technology, money can be transferred through ordinary mobile phones. (Svedberg, 2012)

Mr Subramanian acknowledges that managing the transition to a new system would be difficult. In much of India, citizens have to travel at least 3km (2 miles) to get to a bank. Digital payments are still a minority pursuit. One advantage of the proliferation of welfare schemes is that if one of them fails to pay out, others might. (Economist, 2017)

**But there is hope in digital India, there is a possibility of cash transfer in near future**

The most successful and well-known such scheme is the Kenyan M-PESA (mobile money in Swahili), which can be used for a variety of transactions. It was started in 2007 and as of April 2011, had 14 million subscriber (more than half the adult population). Similar schemes are under implementation in many countries, including India. (Svedberg, 2012)

An Indian operator, Little World, has recently started a branchless micro-banking system based on biometric identification that can be used for cash disbursements of social security pensions, wages under the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (NREGA), housing grants, domestic remittances by migrant labourers and a host of other services. So far the scheme covers only three million households (in 20,000 villages in 18 states), but 25,000 new accounts are opened each day (ibid)

It is hard to believe that India, with its world-class software industry, will not be able to find the technical solutions required for distributing cash electronically to poor households in a CT scheme. In a few years time, it seems that almost every adult Indian will possess a mobile phone. As of September 2011, the total number of wireless subscribers had reached 874 million, reflecting a 25% increase over one year, according to the Telecom Regulatory Authority of India’s latest Indian Telecom Services Performance Indicators from 9 January 2012.21 For Indian households not possessing a mobile phone, the incentive to buy one would be strong for those found eligible for a cash transfer (ibid).

Cash transfers are recognised to be cost effective since they have lower transaction costs and avoid the problem of having to ship, store, transport and distribute commodities. It also allows the beneficiary freedom to direct the benefit to particular household needs. In the context of food, for instance, this could imply a more diverse diet (Narayanan, 2011).
While some of the main advantages of CT are as follows:

**People get free choice to spend their cash on whatever products they wish to buy:**
As is the case now, many ration cardholders only have access to one FPS and therefore little ability to avoid cheating and bad service. With cash, they would be able to choose freely, not only which shop to buy grain from, but also the quality and variety of their preference. Cash transfers will also give households more flexibility to buy food items other than rice and wheat, which may encourage more balanced and nutritious diets. Perhaps most importantly, migrant workers, accounting for between 10% and 16% (depending on definition) of the working age population in 2007-08 (NSS 2010b), who are presently not allowed to use ration cards outside their place of residence, would be able to withdraw cash anywhere. (Svedberg, 2012)

The main advantages with the differentiated CT scheme suggested here are that -

1. About two-thirds of all households can be covered
2. The transfers to the poorest are huge compared to the actual transfers embedded in the TPDS
3. The impact on income distribution is progressive
4. The risk of large exclusion errors is eliminated
5. The scope for corruption and fraud is diminished
6. Operational costs are slashed
7. No poverty lines
8. No central caps are required
9. Objections from the one-third of households left out would probably be muted as they may prefer not to be branded as poor,
10. The overall budget can be held at the level of the present TPDS. To this, one may add that CT schemes of the type Mexico (Oportunidades) and Brazil (Bolsa Familia) have are among the very few large-scale anti-poverty programmes that have proved efficient and effective according to a number of megaevaluations and are now spreading like a wildfire across the world (Hanlon et al 2010). (Svedberg, 2012)

**A study done in Delhi and MP shows that cash transfer don’t make people lazy, cash is not used to consume alcohol or tobacco but people work harder and show positive results**

Madhya Pradesh and Delhi show that monthly unconditional cash transfers do not harm food security and do not encourage unemployment or wasteful expenses. In 2010, Shubhashis Gangopadhyay and others gave households the choice of receiving Rs1,000 in lieu of subsidized food through the public distribution system (PDS). The study found that the fear that households would shift their spending away from nutritious foods was unfounded, and no concomitant increase in the consumption of alcohol was observed. In India’s only experiment with basic income, Guy Standing and others launched two pilots in Madhya Pradesh in 2011 where over 6,000 individuals received monthly payments (Rs300 per adult and Rs150 per child) for 12 to 18 months. This modest sum enabled a multitude of positive impacts on nutrition, health, indebtedness and investment, with women, scheduled castes and the
differently able benefiting the most. The number of hours worked increased in villages receiving the basic income, with no impact on spending on alcohol. While the limited sample size does not allow one to extrapolate the results across the country, they do inspire confidence in the virtues of making small transfers to easily targeted communities in need. (Saksham, 2017)

However, 4 authors studied the MGNREGA scheme, which most closely resembles UBI in India, in which the rural poor are paid for 100 days of fictitious employment every year. The authors found that it reduces the availability of labour in local factories as people rejected working hard at minimum wage when they can get much greater amounts for doing nothing. (Sumit Agarwal, 2017)

If MGNREGA goes beyond a simple increase in rural employment, to incorporating the possibilities of building rural, non-agricultural based livelihoods (as envisioned in the Gansu programme) and even consider linking these to financial incentive packages (a la the Bolsa Familia model), it can emerge as a channel for not just short-term poverty alleviation, but long-term improvement in the capabilities of India’s rural poor. (Fennell, 2012)

One of the first steps that government should take is to identify villager’s needs and accordingly decide where and how to target the right people

Enormous government infrastructure goes into running the system and apart from PDS there are lots of other schemes which are not running well. Look, cash transfer or DBT (Direct Benefit Transfer) is not the solution for everything. For example it works where there are markets to provide those services. In some rural areas there are no proper markets so if you just give cash to the citizen she or he may not be able to go and buy vegetables and rice because there may not be a proper market in that place. So wherever markets are functioning and in large parts markets function well, I think cash transfers or universal income works well. Wherever there is a physical deficiency government needs to provide certain physical good and services I think there is still room for that. (Wire, 2017)

Bolsa Familia, a widely distributed and applauded mass family stipend program, was successful because of its ability to avoid powerful state-based governors. (Fenwick, 2008)

Campaign promises Lula made prior to his election, the main three issue areas the public believed he could accomplish in the four years following his electoral victory were alleviating hunger, misery, and poverty (24 per cent); creating jobs (17 percent); and raising the minimum salary (10 per cent). (Fenwick, 2008)

**Bolsa Familia three key features: Focus on Family, children and able-bodied beneficiaries**

The innovation that came with Bolsa Familia in the field of cash transfers had three features - a focus on family, not individual, entitlements despite specific components for children; the introduction of co-responsibilities or conditionalities and the possibility of having "able-bodied" beneficiaries. Unlike the two other cash transfer programmes, Bolsa Familia aimed to complement the family income rather than replace. (Soares, 2011)

**Learning’s Bolsa Familia took from its first experiments**
The first experiments with CCT programmes in Brazil were undertaken at the sub-national level in 1995 in the Federal District and Campinas and later spread to many medium to large cities in the country as local government initiatives. There was a strong influence on them of the discourse attached to Senator Eduardo Suplicy’s Guaranteed Basic Income proposal, but unlike the proposal, most of them were targeted and had a set of conditionalities attached to them. These local experiments were a major source of inspiration for the CCTS that preceded the Bolsa Familia programme at the federal level. In 1995, the Programa Bolsa Familiar para a Educação (Family Grant Programme for Education) in the Federal District targeted children in poor families (per capita income below one minimum wage) who were between seven and 14 years and paid one minimum wage to a family on the condition that its children have an attendance of 90% in school. (Soares, 2011)

Two interesting components in BF: Vocational training for parents and benefits for children

Bolsa Familia programme had two interesting components that were not common in other CCTS - vocational training courses for parents; and savings accounts for beneficiary children that could only be withdrawn at the end of secondary school. Note that despite having a specific component for adults (parents), this programme only covered families with school-age children. In the same year, the Programa de Garantia de Renda Familiar Minima (Minimum Income Guarantee Programme) in Campinas (Sao Paulo state) covered families in extreme poverty with children up to 14 years of age. Aside from education, there were other co-responsibilities related to health and to attending socio educational meetings, conducted every month by psychologists and social workers (Draibe 2006), (Soares, 2011)

However BF target were children’s education and safety

The first CCT implemented by the federal government was in 1996. The Programa para a Erradicacao do Trabalho Infantil (Programme for the Eradication of Child Labour) was originally implemented only in a few municipalities where children were at risk of working in hazardous occupations such as charcoal production, artisan fishing and sisal growing. The requirement was that the children attend school, and besides the cash transfer, municipalities also received funds to implement socio-educative activities in the extra shift that the children stayed at school (Soares and Satyro), (Soares, 2011).

What makes Bolsa Familia so unique?

Bolsa Familia is the only CCT programme in Latin America that does not use any proxy means test formula for the selection of beneficiaries. Eligibility and the structure of the benefits are determined by self-reported family per capita income and the number of children and teenagers in a household. A family with a per capita income below the extreme poverty line is entitled to a basic benefit, currently set at R$70 ($44.30) independent of the number of children. Families between the extreme poverty line and the poverty line, set at R$140 ($88.60), are only entitled to a variable benefit linked to the presence of children, R$32 ($21) per child up to 15 years old with a limit of three children. Adolescents between 16 and 17 years are entitled to a youth benefit of R$38 ($24) per person, subject to a limit of two per family.
As such, the maximum amount a family can receive from the programme is R$242 ($153) if it is extremely poor and has three children and two teenagers. As per administrative information, the average paid to a family is R$115 ($73). (Soares, 2011)

**Bolsa Familia receives funding from World Bank**

Following the restructuring of Brazil’s safety net programmes, international support was rapidly forthcoming. A few months later in June 2004, the World Bank approved a US$ 572 million sector-wide loan to support Bolsa Familia. It provides funding for cash transfers (96 per cent) as well as technical assistance to develop a unified database, improve targeting, develop a system for monitoring and evaluation and strengthen institutional capacity within the MDS (World Bank, 2004).

Later that year, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) approved a loan of US$ 1 billion for the programme, with a promise of up to twice this amount depending on progress (IDB, 2004). These two commitments totalling US$ 2.57 billion represent almost one-quarter of the estimated funding of R$ 23 billion for Bolsa Familia during the first Lula administration of 2003–06. By any standards this is a very firm international endorsement of the CCT approach to poverty reduction in Brazil. (Hall, Brazil’s Bolsa Familia: a double-edged sword?, September, 2012),

**Municipal managers and social workers active role in Bolsa Familia**

Bolsa Familia relies heavily on the skills of municipal managers and social workers when actively looking for those who could be registered in the single registry. The single registry is a large database that gathers information on potential beneficiaries not only for Bolsa Familia, but also for other targeted social programmes. (Soares, 2011)

The municipalities sign an agreement with the federal government in which their responsibilities are clearly stated. This approach is called a “shared management model” (gestão compartilhada) and is recognised as one of the key factors behind the consolidation of the single registry and the programme’s rapid expansion. (Soares, 2011)

The municipalities are also responsible for following up on compliance with co-responsibilities and uploading the information to the health and education ministries. (Soares, 2011)

"The income is an incentive that we can use to solve other social programmes. Once people are in our database, we can offer them other benefits and target programmes at them. In this way, Bolsa familia is an instrument for wider programmes. It's a platform." (Watts, Brazil's bolsa familia scheme marks a decade of pioneering poverty relief, 2013)

**Federal government ensures the quality of work from Municipalities**

To help the municipalities in the implementation of these activities, the federal government transfers some resources to them on a monthly basis. This financial incentive is based on the decentralised management index (IGD), ranging from 0 to 1, which reflects a simple average of two indicators of the quality of the information in the single registry – the proportion of valid entries (complete information) and updated information (less than two years old); and of two indicators
of the coverage of the conditionality monitoring, one for education and another for health. The higher the IGD, the higher the budget the municipality receives to support the activities related to programme implementation. The IGD is multiplied by the number of beneficiaries in the programme to determine the amount to be transferred. The budget must be used in the implementation of the programme, but the municipalities are free to choose how to do so. For example, they can buy computers, improve the facilities where a Bolsa Família unit works, implement complementary programmes, and so on. (Soares, 2011)

The fulfilment of co-responsibilities is reported by schools (85% of school attendance per month) and health units (regular visits to health centres and following the immunisation calendar according to the Ministry of Health protocol) at the municipal level. This information is transmitted to the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Health, respectively, which are responsible for consolidating the information and reporting to the MDS. (Soares, 2011)

**Process to evaluate child’s health in Bolsa Família**

The AIBF collected anthropometric data in order to evaluate the impact of Bolsa Família on chronic malnutrition (stunting) and acute malnutrition (wasting). Stunting is measured by the lack of height-for-age, and wasting by the lack of body mass for height and age. Unfortunately, the results of the impact evaluation have not yet been made public. The only available results are from the so-called ‘Chamada Nutricional’ (Nutritional Call), an evaluation survey conducted by MDS in health centres of Semi-Arid regions. This evaluation showed a significant impact of Bolsa Família on the reduction of stunting for children aged 6-11 months, and the reduction of wasting for children up to five months old. However, the programme has failed to have an impact on children aged 12-36 months. This is the critical age for nutritional vulnerability because of children’s increasing demand for nutrients. (Soares, Ribas, & Osório, 2007)

**Bolsa Família is not able to remove people from poverty cycle trap but it has positive impact on food consumption**

From the study by Duarte, Sampaio and Sampaio (2009), it can be inferred that 88% of the value of the benefit is used for food consumption, with the conclusion that Bolsa Família has a positive impact on the consumption of food by these families. The study by Soares et al. (2010) also suggests that the BFP is an important poverty relief mechanism for very poor families, and that it has significant effects on child malnutrition. (Mourão & Jesus, 2012)

**Actions taken by the government if family fail to comply Bolsa Família conditions**

With regard to education, the conditionality is reported every two months and for healthcare, every six months. If families fail to comply with conditionalities, they undergo a process of “gradual repercussion” (repercussão gradativa), which is another feature that distinguishes Bolsa Família from most other CCT programmes. The “gradual repercussion” follows five stages. First, the family receives a notification. Next, the benefit is blocked for 30 days; then payment is suspended for two months; and if the conditionality is still not satisfied, suspended for two additional months. Only
in the fifth stage is the benefit cancelled. For non-compliant families with adolescents, the fourth step, that is, the suspension of benefits for two months a second time, is skipped. However, in this case, only the benefits linked to the young members aged 16 and 17 are cancelled. (Soares, 2011)

**An effort by the government to identify the problem faced by families if they are not able to meet up the conditions**

One interesting feature of the Bolsa Família design, which has only recently been implemented, is the idea that noncompliance with co-responsibilities is a sign that a family faces an additional vulnerability. A social worker should verify the reasons for the family failing to uphold the co-responsibilities and also help it to overcome these difficulties. This social worker should be linked to a CRAS, or Social Assistance Reference Centre, or to a CRAS Specialised Social Assistance Reference Centre. This component was strengthened in September 2009 by creating an intergovernmental and inter-sectoral forum to monitor co-responsibilities, bringing together representatives of the three levels of government (federal, state and municipal) and from the three areas most closely related to the programme, education, health and social assistance. The two major challenges to this process are to increase the proportion of families with health co-responsibilities monitored every six months, which now stands at 67.5% (Curralero et al 2010) and to increase the number of families assisted by a CRAS when they fail to fulfil co-responsibilities. (Soares, 2011)

**Therefore, the program was able to reduce the poverty**

Soares, Souza, Osorio and Silveira (2010) show that Bolsa Família was responsible for a 16% fall in inequality that took place between 1999 and 2009. This is a remarkable achievement since it represents only 0.7% of the income of the families. Its high coverage and good targeting explains this good performance. As for its impact on poverty and extreme poverty, the authors show that Bolsa Família was responsible for a 16% and 33% fall, respectively. (Soares, 2011)

The research generally shows that the average family income of non-beneficiaries is greater than the income of beneficiaries, even in the same region of residence. This is a significant indicator of the BFP’s criteria of equality. (Mourão & Jesus, 2012)

It has contributed to a fall in poverty (mostly extreme poverty) and inequality in the country, despite not being mainly responsible for this trend, which has been basically driven by an improvement in the distribution of labour income. It has also had a positive impact on intermediate inputs that can improve the human capital of the next generation, mainly health and education outcomes, as with most CCTs in Latin America. Moreover, it has not been shown to have had a negative impact on labour supply. (Soares, 2011)

**Unlike India, Brazil did not replace cash transfer with other welfare schemes.**

Bolsa Família did not aim to replace all social policy or reduce it to a poverty-reduction strategy, as some of its critics allege, but its implementation has helped to highlight the needs of the poor and the existing gaps and inequities in the delivery and actual outcomes of education, health and social assistance policies. (Soares, 2011)
Government plan to tackle extreme poverty
There has recently been much talk on the need to tackle the social and economic exclusion of beneficiary families, which could mean a move towards something similar to Chile Solidario, particularly because the government is now discussing a plan to eradicate extreme poverty. The challenge here is to find effective ways to incentivise cooperation among the line ministries and different programmes as well as to evaluate what works and what does not work in the fight against social and economic exclusion. (Soares, 2011)

A recent increase in the value of the benefits suggests that the income support offered by the programme will be a strong component of the new plan. The increase benefited more families with many children, which are, on average, poorer than other families, signalling the priority that the extreme poor will have in the next phase of the programme. The most difficult task here will be to fight exclusion errors, that is, to reach extremely poor families who are so socially excluded that they do not manage to make their way into the single registry to become beneficiaries of the programme. Again, the municipalities will play a major role if this lack of coverage is to be seriously addressed. (Soares, 2011)

One of the main criticisms faced by Bolsa Familia
This is one the main criticisms of Bolsa Familia – that it does little to address inequality because it keeps the poor just above a subsistence level, without the means to move up the social ladder. But there is an element of the programme that makes it a long-term investment in the future. (Watts, Brazil's bolsa familia scheme marks a decade of pioneering poverty relief, 2013)

While the Bolsa Familia is unlikely to lift adults out of poverty, the hope is that it will create the health and education conditions for the next generation to think beyond the next meal of farinha. (Watts, Brazil's Bolsa Familia scheme marks a decade of pioneering poverty relief, 2013)

As regards social mobility, research states that the BFP is not being effective in changing the conditions of the beneficiaries; in other words, few are achieving the conditions necessary to exit the programme. However, data show that beneficiaries are participating in more professional and IT courses and are more optimistic about their future quality of life. An issue that needs to be considered is the programme’s maturity period, as it is about to turn eight years old; maybe this period is too short to promote social mobility, as the BFP is aimed a lot more at children than at the generation of parents. Therefore, the time taken to create this “way out” could be longer than the time that the programme has been in existence. (Mourão & Jesus, 2012)

But that the greatest challenge is to provide employment opportunities and basic services to that population. This is precisely the focus of the government’s ambitious anti-poverty program, Brasil Sem Miseria, which promises to help millions of Brazilians escape extreme poverty. (Worldbank, 2014)

The results suggest that the managers of the programme need to pay particular attention to conditioning factors, especially those related to rights to health, which are still little-used. Even so, thought should be given to the universal nature of secondary
education, as basic education is now practically universal. (Mourão & Jesus, 2012)

**Learning’s from Bolsa Familia for Universal Basic Income in India**

1. **Making changes in the existing schemes rather than replacing it:** If we study both of the schemes, Universal Basic Income has to set-up many things to make it sure it runs effectively. In 1995 in Brazil, the Programa Bolsa Familiar para a Educacao (Family Grant Programme for Education) program targeted children’s education but later component of vocational training for parents were also added. It did not replace any schemes but ensured the existing scheme got a wider target for the benefit of family. Brazil government also ensured experiments were conducted to test and adapt to the scheme.

2. **There should be no conditions for non-poor or have clear target too see impact:** In Bolsa Familia focus was on children which helped to lay out clear objectives and see specifics results. Universal Basic Income should either have no strict conditionalities for non-poor or should be able to have clear beneficiaries target to children/women to get the required benefits and have impact.

3. **One single registry platform for all the schemes:** If India is successful to register all the non-poor on one platform, it will be beneficial for government to be able to benefit the beneficiaries on the local and state level. Brazil has one platform where all the data is stored making it easier for government to target the right people and transfer the required cash to variety of welfare schemes.

4. **Work locally with municipals and ensure quality work in impact, monitoring and evaluation:** Federal system in Brazil has successfully taken responsibility of distributing the cash and ensured local municipalities are present for impact, evaluation and monitoring. This technique also helped to cut down the corruption by the middlemen. Also, federal government added monetary incentive to ensure the quality of evaluation is intact. This is huge learning for India where there is huge problem of wastage, leakage and corruption.

5. **Funding from the external sources:** If Universal Basic Income is able to receive fund from the external sources it will make huge difference to quality and impact of the programme. Funding is not only required for providing cash transfers but to lay the administrative system and pay good amount of salaries to people (like social workers) involved in the programme to have the motivation and commitment.

6. **Bolsa Familia approaches bottom-up technique to ensure the quality and impact:** Even though Bolsa Familia has not able to remove the families from poverty cycle, it does have long term planning for children’s education and eradicating hunger. There always adapting and learning from
people’s needs instead of top–down approach they have bottom–up approach which makes it so unique from other cash transfer schemes.

**Conclusion**

Government of India should set-up proper administrative systems, arrange for sufficient funds, study the people and area well enough before taking any steps to replace the welfare schemes with Universal Basic Income. There are advantages in implementing this scheme only if it is done in the right way otherwise the consequences could have dire effect on the poor people. Instead of alleviating the poverty, it could impact in negative way.
References


Kumar, G. P. (2014). Why direct cash transfer shouldn’t be used to kill the PDS. Firstpost dated 20 December, 2014.


Mourão, & Jesus, M. d. (2012). C- Bolsa Família (Family Grant) Programme: an analysis of Brazilian income transfer programme. Field Actions Science Reports.


---

**About the Author**

Tehmina Sabuwala works for GAP (Global Action on Poverty) Labs at TISS. Global Action on poverty supports Changemakers idea to eradicate poverty in different domains. GAP’s vision is to work with one million changemakers in five years’ time. She can be contacted on tehmina.sabuwala@tiss.edu
COMMENTARY

WHAT THEY WERE? WHO THEY ARE? WHAT THEY WANT TO BE?

Tracing Violence in lives of homeless women in India

By Smita Khanijow

“My life’s greatest wish is an uninterrupted night’s sleep: without the noise of traffic, the glare of street lights, the perils of sexual and physical assaults and the brutality of the police”. - The wish list of a homeless women, Saroja Devi

Of Homeless Women & Violence in India

Homelessness has emerged as a global human rights crisis in recent times. It manifests differently in diverse social, cultural, economic contexts and is as much a problem of industrialised countries as it is for developing nations. While, homelessness continues to be a serious deprivation of access to housing, increasingly the issue is being looked as an extreme form of social exclusion, discrimination and loss of dignity.

The ongoing Habitat processes and the World Assembly of Inhabitants\(^1\) both recognized that the question of adequate housing is not limited exclusively to the shelter and it “means more than just a roof over one’s head.”\(^2\) Infact, the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to housing, Leilani Farha is soon going to present a report to Human Security Council session in March 2016, where has linked homelessness to all other human rights; including the right to life and non-discrimination. And has expressed need to understand the less visible experiences of homelessness, particularly of women.

Earlier also in 2005 the UN Special Rapporteur on the right to housing, Miloon Kothari had elaborated on intersectionality of homelessness and violence faced by homeless women in its an annual report to Economic and Social Council. In his report, he stated that the problem of homelessness in women “must first address in their access, or lack thereof, to the skills, resources and place in the community that allow for the securing of adequate housing. In many places, the lack of educational and employment opportunities for women often necessitates reliance on family, informal support networks, or a partner or spouse”. It is important to note to here that all the factors listed above reflect a complex relationship between kind of violence faced by women before being homeless and then after\(^3\).

In India, homelessness or houseless is defined as – “those who live in “the open or roadside, pavements, in pipes, under flyovers and staircases, or in the open in places of worship, railway platforms etc.” As per Census 2011, there are 1.77 million homeless, out of which nearly 41% are women. However, after this survey, a handbook by the Commissioners of the Supreme Court pointed out gaps in

---

\(^1\) World Assembly of Inhabitants- at the World Social Forum 2015, various civil society groups converged as thematic assemblies and World Assembly of Inhabitants was one such process.

\(^2\) The Habitat Agenda, Paragraph 60, 1996

\(^3\) Women and adequate housing- Study by the Special Rapporteur on adequate housing as a component of the right to an adequate standard of living, Miloon Kothari
mapping of homeless concentration pockets. Thus, keeping this in view, conservative estimates put nearly 45% of homeless population as women which implies 8.3 hundred thousand are women living on streets in India.

The Census 2011 data also brought out that 90% of these women live in highly urbanised areas of states like Maharashtra, Karnataka, Uttar Pradesh, Delhi, and West Bengal. The average literacy rate of these women is 56% which is much lower than the national average of 74% literacy. And the work participation ratio for homeless women is 43% in rural areas and 32% in urban areas.

So as one can infer from data that while, these women are engaged in economic activity by either working as ‘contract labourers, vending’, or any other informal work they are houseless. The reasons for women being homeless are far more complex than homeless man.

Chaudhry (et al 2014) stated that “Women are rendered homeless due to displacement from rural areas- land grabbing and acquisitions results in forced migrations to cities. The lack of affordable housing and forced evictions without resettlement in urban areas are yet another cause of homelessness for women.” Some other grounds which push women to leave their homes are domestic violence and abuse, some women are thrown out of their homes and many mentally ill women are abandoned by their families.

This is also evident in findings of a survey done in 2008 by Ashraya Adhikara Abhiyan (Housing Rights Campaign group) and the Institute of Human Behavior and Allied Sciences (IHBAS), one of India’s leading mental hospitals, which revealed that 70% of the women had no source of income, 19% accounted loss of their slum quarters as a major reason for their homelessness, 2.9% of women, said they were homeless because of family disputes and 78 % reported mental illness or desertion by husbands.

Various other reasons have also been ascribed for homelessness amongst women in India, prime being the lack of security of tenure and as well as the failure to recognize women’s property rights within, outside and upon dissolution of marriage or domestic partnership.
State and Civil Society Response

Homeless people suffer substantial policy neglect, not just in India, but also globally\(^4\). In India, it was the Campaign on Shelter rights which drew state’s attention on homelessness. The harsh winters and cold deaths of homeless people in 2000, lead to writ petition in Supreme Court by civil society groups. The Court took note and provided relief in the legal framework for policy architecture in favour of the urban homeless in 2001. It directed the appointment of Commissioners to the Supreme Court on the issue. These Commissioners time and again submit directions and policy guidelines on shelter and other basic services for homeless in the country.

In March 2012, the then President of India, Mrs Pratibha Patel also elaborated on the issue of homelessness in Parliament and declared, the “National Programme for Urban Homeless”. The scheme came into force in 2013, covering 790 cities, directing state governments to build permanent, all-weather shelters for urban homeless people with basic infrastructure like water supply, sanitation, safety and security.

Despite these initiatives and rulings, very little has been done on the ground, a recent media report brought to notice that “only 208 houses were built though the full financial grants were provided to the states. Nothing is detailed on the condition of safety and security of homeless person’s man or women”\(^5\).

Amidst this, the situation of homeless women is even more precarious. A study\(^6\) done in 2009, by women’s organisation Jagori, UN Women and UN Habitat brought out safety of homeless women as a major concern in the capital of India- "both within and outside the night shelters".

It elaborated on six key issues of homeless women which included - "abject poverty which significantly increased their vulnerabilities, fear of men in groups and especially when men are drunk and intoxicated, harassment from police on the streets and other places. The women also raised the issue of lack of access to basic amenities, including clean and safe public toilets, drinking water and shelter. Homeless women, in particular, are acutely vulnerable to sexual violence," the study stated.

Further highlighting challenges faced by homeless women, the report noted, these women also have to regularly negotiate "with transient men for their so-called security and safety. They sleep in fear, never knowing who will trample on their dignity and body".

In another report, on situation of homeless women in national capital New Delhi, Chaudhary (2014) noted that “in a few shelter homes homeless women and their children, face sexual abuse, violence, rape, and police brutality. And homeless women

---


\(^6\) Safe Cities Free of Violence Against Women and Girls Initiative A Draft Strategic Framework for Women’s Safety in Delhi 2010, Department of Women and Child Development, Government of NCT Delhi
have no avenues available for them to seek redress or justice. No action is ever taken against police authorities or other government officials responsible for acts of violence against homeless women. There is acute shortage of public toilets for women; this further increases their vulnerability to sexual violence and abuse. Many homeless women remain awake at night to watch over their young daughters as they fear for their safety. There is a lack of adequate measures to provide for homeless women who are pregnant or young mothers”.

While there is growing concern about violence faced by homeless women there is very limited understanding of about factors which might increase or decrease victimization risk, consequences of this violence, and interactions of homeless woman with the criminal justice system.

Few civil society organisations such as the Calcutta Samaritans and Iswar Sankalpa of West Bengal and educational institutes like TISS in Maharashtra, have tried to study linkages between mental health and homelessness. But these are very limiting in scope and as many other facets need to be delved into.

**Homeless Women in India- the Untold Story**

In developed countries like the United States, “the incidence of sexual assault among homeless women is more than twenty times greater than that of the rest of the population” (Kelly, 1985: 87). And there is recognition of “limitations to available research on homeless women, who have experienced sexual assault. (Nyamathi, Wenzel, Lesser, Flaskerud, & Leake, 2001; Wenzel, Leake, & Gelberg, 2000).

But here in India, compared to the United States, we have dearth of analysis on homeless women and the kind of violence they face. So though there is enough evidence on establishing the fact that violence is committed on homeless women, but there is very less information exploring the risk factors responsible for it, the role that such violence plays in lives of homeless women, or the consequences of violence in their lives.

In 2014, a report, on Violation of homeless women in India, recommended the need for looking at the issue of homeless women with an inter-sectional approach so as to address these issues. What, therefore, needs to be done is:

- To undertake an in-depth analysis on issues of violence faced by such women, looking at the continuum of violence and victimization before, during and after episodes of homelessness.
- To develop a deeper understanding of multiple forms of discrimination that homeless women faces on grounds including class, caste, health, disability, sexual orientation, and other factors.

---


8 D. Wright James, Jana L. Jasinski; Jennifer K. Wesely; Elizabeth Mustaine; (2005) The Experience of Violence in the Lives of Homeless Women. US department of Justice

9 Violence and Violations: The Reality of Homeless Women in India- Shivani Chaudhary, Amita Joseph and Indu Prakash Singh
To determine how these affect her access to shelter or public health services.

The study can help to consolidate a body of action research work between homelessness and violence and will help scholars, civil society actors and policy makers to intervene with homeless communities so as to prevent further assault.

**How this can be done?**

An exploratory research can be undertaken involving both primary interviews, and focus group discussions with communities, key stakeholders and review of secondary data sources including reports of state, civil society organisations etc.

Attempt needs to be done to study homelessness as a process by drawing a narrative research design to trace stories of select homeless women and their experiences of violence. This element in research designing can help in understanding- who these homeless women were, what they are now and what they want to be like in future.

This is significant for as Arendt (1965) points out “a narrative does not attempt to uncover some essential element buried beneath but rather seeks to foreground new or different understanding through social interaction”. Hence, qualitative recording of interactions between interviewer and homeless respondent may help unravel the “multiple identities and faces of the label “(Goodley et al 2004) of homelessness. More so this approach can frame the discussion from a vantage point of how homeless women sees herself and what she thinks could be ways to break through the challenges.

**What value addition this research will do?**

Increasing urbanisation, initiatives like ‘100 smart cities’ and ambition for ‘Housing for All by 2020’, necessitate urgent need to understand the problem of women’s vulnerability to homelessness along with suggesting housing and health policies which can integrate overall women’s human rights.

It is important at this stage, to study these aspects for policies “may end up bringing homeless shelters, but these may not be equipped to handle the myriad of problems that women in it may be dealing with. Shelters, for example, appear to be more equipped to handle needs such as healthcare and the immediate issue of housing. However, they may not be prepared to delve deep into the childhood experiences of the women that arrive at their facilities. Without such abilities, homeless women are in danger of repeating the cycle over and over and putting both themselves and their children in grave danger”10.

Therefore, an informed research at this stage on violence continuum faced by homeless women and services they avail will help in bridging gap between policy and praxis. It will help in identification of systemic barriers homeless women face in finding support at the time of crisis.

---

10 The Experience of Violence in the Lives of Homeless Women: A Research Report- Jana L. Jasinski; Jennifer K. Wesely; Elizabeth Mustaine; James D. Wright
Simultaneously, such kind of research will help build further understanding on realities of life on the streets for women and programmatically, it will help in developing the agency of homeless women in India.

References

- ActionAid India (2003), *Study on Homelessness and Beggary*
- Commissioners of the Supreme Court in the Case of Writ Petition (Civil) 196 of 2001 *Shelters for the Urban Homeless*
- D. Wright James, Jana L. Jasinski; Jennifer K. Wesely; Elizabeth Mustaine; (2005) *The Experience of Violence in the Lives of Homeless Women.* US department of Justice
- IGSSS and Praxis (2010), *Findings from a Participatory Reflection and Action (PRA) exercise with homeless residents of the Pul Mithai community, located in the area of Old Delhi, in close proximity to the Old Delhi Railway Station*
- Kothari Miloon, UN Special Rapporteur (E/CN.4/2005/43, February 2005), *Women and adequate housing*
- Mander, Harsh (2012), *Living Rough Surviving City Streets* OHRC (2015)- *Reports on women and housing and Handbook on UN Basic Principles and Guidelines on Development based Evictions and Displacement*
- Reid, Shyanne (2009) *Living on the Streets in Canada: A Feminist Narrative Study of Girls and Young Women.* Published online June 2009

• UN-HABITAT, Jagori & Women Child Development Department GoI (2010)- Safe cities free of violence against women and girls initiative, Safer Cities Programme

**About the author**

Smita Khanijow has been working on gender rights especially on issue of declining child sex ratio. She is member of State Supervisory Board for implementation of PCPNDT Act in Delhi. Smita works with ActionAid India in Delhi.
COMMENTARY

A REPORT OF A CAMPAIGN ON CHILD MALNUTRITION
- By Abid Faheem

India faces a unique development paradox of being in the front ranks of fast growing global economies, with vibrant economic growth rates and yet, in stark contrast – around 40% of India’s children under three years of age are undernourished.

According to Planning Commission (2014) India’s Nutrition Challenges call for urgent action, as a critical development imperative for ensuring faster, more inclusive and sustainable growth. Nutrition is crucial for the fulfilment of human rights – especially those of the most vulnerable children, girls and women, locked in an intergenerational cycle of multiple deprivations. It constitutes the foundation for human development, by reducing susceptibility to infections, reducing related morbidity, disability and mortality, enhancing cumulative lifelong learning capacities, and adult productivity. It is critical to prevent under nutrition, as early as possible, across the life cycle, to avert irreversible cumulative growth and development deficits that compromise maternal and child health and survival, achievement of optimal learning outcomes in education and gender equality (Planning Commission, 2014).

India is one of the highest-ranking countries in the world for the number of children suffering from malnutrition where 30% of the world malnourished children live. Data from the Global Hunger Index that measures malnutrition, stunting and mortality rates of under-five shows that one in three children in India has stunted growth, whereas 15 percent of the population is undernourished. According to the report of Global Hunger Index (2016) 38.7 percent of Indian children under five years are stunted due to lack of food. India has many programs but due to improper implementation of the program it couldn’t tackle the issue of Malnutrition and it has become a social disease. Nobel Laureate Amartya Sen in an interview said that though India had made progress in the social and economic sectors it has failed in the field of childcare and nutrition, which is a "terrible" handicap for the country.

This also violates the children’s rights given under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) and the Indian Constitution. According to article 3 of UNCRC, the best interests of children must be the primary concern in making decisions that may affect them while article 4 states that Governments have a responsibility to take all available measures to make sure children’s rights are respected, protected and fulfilled.

Also, as per the article 27of UNCRC, Children have the right to a standard of living that is good enough to meet their physical and mental needs. Governments should help families and guardians who cannot afford to provide this, particularly with regard to food, clothing and housing. According to the article 39 of the Indian Constitution, the State shall, in particular, direct its policy towards securing that the health and strength of workers, men and women, and the tender age of children are not abused and that citizens are not forced by economic necessity to enter vocations.
unsuited to their age or strength and that children are given opportunities and facilities to develop in a healthy manner and in conditions of freedom and dignity and that childhood and youth are protected against exploitation and against moral and material abandonment.

The Directive Principle of State Policy under the Article 47 considers it the primary duty of the state to improve public health, securing of justice, human condition of works, extension of sickness, old age, disablement and maternity benefits and also contemplated. This makes improvement of public health a primary duty of State. Under this article the State shall regard the raising of the level of nutrition and standard of living of its people and improvement of public health as among its primary duties.

Though in the above provisions the rights of the children to live a dignify life is mentioned very clearly but in reality nothing is complied with it and the current decision of the government to link Aadhar card with Mid-day-Meal is another step to exclude a certain section of the population from access to food which is also violation of Supreme Court order.

The most startling aspect of the nutrition situation in India is that it is not much of an issue in public debates. It has been seen that this important issue is always been neglected and this can be better understood from the case of Malkangiri where 300 children died within one month and no national level media gave a space to that and this issue which can be termed as the killing of children couldn’t get the attention of our bureaucrats. Also, UNICEF report says that India holds the first position in child malnutrition under age 5 where 30% of world malnourished children live.

According to UNICEF, nearly half of all deaths in children under 5 are attributable to under nutrition. This translates into the unnecessary loss of about 3 million young lives a year. Under nutrition puts children at greater risk of dying from common infections, increases the frequency and severity of such infections, and contributes to delayed recovery.

Forum for Learning and Action with Innovation and Rigour (FLAIR), estimates more than 15 lakh children below five years of age died in India. Lack of basic sanitation in India is seen as a key reason for severe child malnutrition burden.

About 21,000 people die every day of hunger or hunger-related causes, according to the UNICEF. This is one person every four seconds. Sadly, it is children who die most often. Added to this, the recent news reports of malnutrition deaths of children in Malkangiri and Koraput in Odisha and Palghar in Maharashtra led the student team to believe that this issue requires urgent attention. Hence, it was necessary to raise awareness regarding the issue.

It is against these backdrop that On 23rd February few students of the Centre for Equity and Justice for Children and Families (School of Social Work) at Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai organized a day long campaign on Child Malnutrition under the theme of “Child Malnutrition: Destroying all hopes.” The purpose of this campaign was to make the people aware about the prevalence of child malnutrition in India and the gravity of the issue which has become a social disease and requires a greater attention. The campaign also aimed to recommend possible solutions to stakeholders by seeking views from Public
To raise the awareness and highlight the issue of malnutrition following activities was carried out by the students -

- Exhibition of facts and figures related to malnutrition deaths in India
- Poster and Article Exhibition
- Collaboration with Fight Hunger Foundation
- Documentary Screening
- “Opinion wall” where people wrote their views and ideas on how to tackle the problem of child malnutrition.
- Tying of wrist-bands with “#EndMalnutrition” written on it and asking the visitors to spread the message to at least two persons they meet throughout the day and asking them to do the same. In this way the message spread like a chain reaction.

The message was delivered through different means and methods. Social media and networking websites were used most to deliver the message. Also at the day of campaign message was delivered through different activities like exhibition of facts and figures, exhibitions of articles, documentary screening, opinion wall, tying of wrist-bands, posters etc.

Students and faculties expressed their views on the campaign. Some of the comments are given below -

- “Right to life, survival and development”, ‘Nutrition is a human right”
- “No access to food due to poverty”
- “Save children from malnutrition”
- “Massive campaign requires”
- “Needs effective implementation”
- “It’s good to see organising such kind of activity, else children always get missing in whole debate and discussion”
- “Rather than making so many policies and programs institutions should focus on implementation, supervision and monitoring”
- “A massive campaign should be conducted against the government institutions”
- “3% of GDP should be allocated health and nutrition of the children”
- “Spreading awareness about the implementation of mothers’ milk”
- “Skip a meal’ project where people can provide those food or savings to the malnourished children”

The campaign was successfully organized with the efforts of the organizing members and support from the faculties and other students and the member of the organizing committee would like to continue their efforts to create the awareness and advocacy in this field. The message was delivered to the audience successfully through different means. Also, public feedback is delivered to the organizations working in the area of child malnutrition so that they can incorporate the suggestions in their intervention methods. In this way this campaign helped in creating awareness not only among the students of TISS campus but also among the people living outside the campus and to the organizations working in the area of child malnutrition as well.
Acknowledgement: The campaign was organised by a group of students from M.A. Social Work in Equity for Children and Families at Tata Institute of Social Sciences including Abid Faheem, Divya L.K, Manika, Manish, Megha, Rahul Rasal, Rabi Sah and Roohi Najia. Their contributions are deeply acknowledged. Faculty members of the Centre for Equity for Children and Families and more specifically the faculty guide for the exercise Dr. Mohua Nigudkar deserves a special mention here.

About the Author: Abid Faheem is a second year student of M.A Social Work in Equity for Children and Families at Tata Institute of Social Sciences. He is also the General Secretary of the Student Union (2016-17) at Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai.
COMMENTARY

COACHING IN THE SOCIAL SPACE
- By ‘Sumanaharaya’ Gayatri Anandh

Introduction

Aligned to The UN’s 1st Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) is ‘No Poverty’.

Global Action on Poverty (GAP’s) objective is to accelerate the impact produced by a diverse set of committed, passionate individuals known as Changemakers, who are tirelessly working to bring people out of poverty through myriad ways.

GAP provides these Changemakers a range of resources and capabilities through different partners, to enable them to transform the level at which they work.

As an initiative of Head Held High Foundation (HHH), GAP’s journey started in 2014 when a few passionate people came together to design a collaborative space where actionable steps could be taken to eradicate poverty. The conversations led to the launch of Global Action on Poverty in March, 2015 at the Sabarmati Gandhi Ashram in Ahmedabad, India. The two-day event brought together 300+ individuals who pledged to wipe out poverty by working collaboratively.

With these two events and continuing engagements with the Changemakers, GAP has had an exciting two years and has brought together 250 Changemakers from 68 Districts across India 165 Partners, 30 Professional Coaches & 20 Mentors to galvanize the leadership of Changemakers in India and around the globe.

Poverty exists in the outer world when helplessness, indignity or indifference are experienced in the inner world. On this tenet, GAP launched GAP coaching as a service to the change makers it supports.

GAP is inspired by the notion of a world of abundance – a world where there is no lack, no poverty. We believe that everyone can and must contribute to make this dream come true.

My Journey as a GAP Coach

Coaching model that I used - Be your Own Divine Master (BODMAS). I have always experienced coaching as a spiritual journey, going from knowledge to knowing; ability to go beyond personhood, to draw internal strength and generate from now.

My quest has always been for serving, thus when GAP happened, it struck a chord with me. I found an application of service as a coach and also application of leadership when only that serves.

GAP CMs themselves are servant leaders and as a servant coach at heart, I focus on the coaching partner I am serving, to become wiser, healthier, freer, more autonomous and more likely to become servant.

I set out as a coach for Pasha in late March, early April 2016. Pasha had been running an NGO since 2011, and while he had taken initiatives, a focused channeling,
manifestation of goals picked up tremendous pace after enrolling with GAP.

I met him on 6th April, 2016 in Bangalore at his residence. I was moved to see that his wife and many of his associates are also visually challenged. His daughter is able bodied, 7-year-old young spritely girl.

I began my journey to know him. While Pasha can’t see, he never lacked vision.

From the very beginning, I was very delighted with his ability to communicate, his clarity of thoughts and his ability to enroll people. His conviction and the power he packs when he speaks of his vision and dream are unparalleled.

It was my fickle mindedness that I first saw him with disability, I recognized that he sees the world without disability and he made it so much easier for me to talk to him as equals.

We discussed his vision, plan and challenged the assumptions, budgets; he was equally gracious and open to accepting change from his laid out plan.

As a first step, we documented his vision, his area of work and details of his NGO and set out the goals to materialize his vision.

We raised funds to complete his first vision of empowering visually challenged students with a device such that they can record the lectures and listen to them at their leisure to understand the notes. A function was conducted whereby the device was distributed to all 60 students and scholarship was given to bright young girls.

I recall a conversation when Pasha discussed this goal to give the recorders. He was struggling with the funds needed for the same. On further exploring the subject, it became clear to Pasha that he could consider alternate low cost models available in the market to deliver the same functionality instead of considering only a branded one. He moved fast on this awareness and spoke to vendors to source, test and finalise an affordable model. The girls felt connected, appreciated and heard.

The next vision was to educate, train and empower these girls by bringing them together under one roof to impart training and tuitions. This goal had emerged in our goal setting exercise at the outset. In one of the sessions when we explored this, I guided him through a visualization session. At the end of the session Pasha set a goal to set up hostel by beginning of June, the number of girls to accommodate and a monthly budget to run the hostel. With this objective, a hostel had been started from June18th. This has also generated employment for a cook and a warden.

I took Pasha through a similar visualization and quite meditation, for Community empowerment project, he completed his campaign with the Panchayat officials for disability reservation grants for self employment. As a result, the taluk has sanctioned Rs 3 lakhs by the District Panchayat Rural.

Two girls in his hostel have regained her eyesight in one eye, and one of them, one day Amrajyoti wishes to server the Army. After the girl’s hostel was started, Pasha called me worried about how he will fund the coming months to run the hostel. I asked him simple question, ‘What made him
believe that he funded the hostel or that he ran the hostel? It created a huge shift in him, from Success (Self-Serving) to Significance (Service); and the conviction that its God’s work and focus on service will self-serve the cause. If you think you are the doer, you get attached to the task.

Pasha also recognized his need to learn and undertook a month long Training program with Head Held High Foundation (HHH) in Bhubaneswar.

HHH conducts a 4 day rigorous workshop called the perspectives whereby you complete your past, recognize internal power and practice enrolling people.

Pasha also improved his skills in spoken English and as a trainer. This allowed Pasha to formally start training programs for his students.

Even for personal matters, I was able to support him. I recall in one coaching session, he was feeling low and wanted to discuss about his mother being sick and hospitalized. He had not visited her even though she was in Bangalore as he felt burdened by the loan he had taken from the family for his operation and his inability to pay. My discussion with him gave the perspective of delinking the two issues and he took the action of meeting his mom. The lightness he felt describing the same spoke for itself.

He means his words and if he promises to take an action, he does not look back. That passion and commitment has made our coaching partnership so enriching.

It has been a pleasure and humbling experience knowing Pasha as a change maker he has only scratched the surface to unveil the potential among women who are physically challenged.

**Servant Leadership**

Servant leadership is an emerging concept in the Agile Software Development Methodology. I draw from this model to relate to the social space. Following aspects are pivotal to servant leadership; and I believe GAP Changemakers are Servant Leaders themselves and need to be coached for servant leadership.

As you enter a season of leadership, quality of your service will be direct result of your spiritual preparation.

A servant looks within oneself to resolve a problem. He does not externalize and escape the issue.

Qualities that are essential for servant leaders to inculcate:

**Listening:** Receptive listening and reflection are essential to the growth of a servant leader. A servant first listens. God’s first language is silence, everything else is poor translation. Listening deeply to Pasha, listen to who he is, led both of us to create trust between each other and a safe space for exploration.

**Empathy:** Servant leaders strive to understand and empathize with others. They accept and recognize followers for their unique spirits; and they assume others have good intentions, even if they disagree with behavior or performance.

In a few months into the commencement of the hostel, Pasha started facing conflicts/issues with the management
committee. Our coaching session helped him to delink issue from the person.

**Awareness** is not a giver of solace, it is just the opposite. It is disturber and an awakener. Able leaders are usually sharply awake and reasonably disturbed. They are not seekers after solace. They have their own inner serenity.

Servant leaders exhibit a general awareness of what is happening in the organization. They possess a keen sense of self-awareness and an understanding of issues involving ethics and values. Servant leaders are often described as disturbers and awakeners. Every time Pasha calls me up with a churn in his stomach about an issue, he leaves the conversation with a new dream, new goal and draws power from the unrest.

Persuasion, conceptualization, foresight, stewardship, commitment to the growth, building community and healing are some of other qualities in servant leader.

**Coaching with a Servant’s Heart**

I recognize that changemakers in the social space are servant leaders themselves and need to be coached with a servant’s heart.

I have adapted following in my conversations with my change partners.

There are two ways to think about a problem that’s slightly too hard for you to solve – 1) Are you smart enough to solve it or 2) Have you just not solved it yet? This is the power of yet, reward yet. When you say, I have not achieved this yet versus I have failed to achieve, you engage with the error deeply, you process the error to correct it. One of my coaching partners once said, ‘I can’t say no when I don’t want to say yes. I helped him rephrase, you have not yet learnt the art of saying no that helped him to open up his mindset.

- **Outcome is futuristic:** When you think of the outcome, you have drifted from the present. Creating possibility from the now has made Pasha unstoppable. When Pasha had taken one of the girls to the hospital for eye care, the hospital put the girl on drips, but plugged it out when it was not clear who will pay for the admission. Instead of getting bogged down or frustrated, this generated a new possibility in Pasha’s mind to start a free hospital for the blind and disabled.

- **Detachment from outcome (I am not the doer):** We had a profound learning when Pasha was wanting to raise funds. I took him through a visualization session and asked him to intend and detach from the outcome. If you think you are the doer, you get attached to the task. Your presence gets limited and you act from the awareness of a limited personhood.

- **Power of Intention:** It is amazing how the power of Intention worked so strongly with both of us intending for funds to his cause and we were able to raise 1.5 lakhs in two months to support the initiatives.

- **Self-Reflection/Search for Wholeness:** I encourage my partner to search for wholeness; one of my partners started with a discussion but twice touched upon a personal issue but avoided talking, I paused and encouraged the person to explore
that and the rest of conversation was about that issue.

Other things which I focus on is to encourage and ask for help, awareness/stay alert/challenge, dealing with fear/dilemma, mission as a motivator and stress reliever, Service minded decisions, admitting to mistakes and asking forgiveness.

**Conclusion**
This journey has been very enriching for me as a person. I have seen the power of awareness, the power on intent and the formidable spirit of Pasha has been a huge inspiration to me.

Coaching in the social space is about coaching for servant leadership. It is about keeping that little fire in the heart of the change maker burning, which allows the change maker to weather the worst of winters and darkest of nights.

**Sources:**


Nawaz Pasha’s work with Global Action on Poverty

**About the Author**

‘Sumanaharaya’ Gayatri Anandh works for GAP coach. Global Action on Poverty (GAP) supports Changemakers idea to eradicate poverty in different domains. GAP’s vision is to work with one million changemakers in five years’ time.
NEWS AND EVENTS

BE A CHANGEMAKER!
By Global Action on Poverty (GAP)

Within two years, since its launch at Sabarmati Ashram, GAP has progressed a lot. With the vision of building and supporting Changemaker communities to eradicate poverty.

Who can be a GAP Changemaker?


- Open to new perspectives and ideas and ready to adopt new ways to increase impact.

- Committed and totally passionate about the change that they want to make happen on the ground.

- Engaged in an initiative or idea for a minimum of one year and ready for further support.

- Driven to make the initiative a success and open to growing themselves, their teams and their initiatives.

- Deeply committed to wiping out poverty and ready to work with others to make it happen. GAP intends to walk alongside our Changemakers on their journeys and provide support in every way possible so that their impact can be increased.

At GAP, we have been planning and creating new and exciting programs and we would like to invite you to engage and benefit from them. These programs have been co-created with Partners from across different sectors and have a lot of richness and depth that will be relevant for you and your initiative.

We want you to be part of the new GAP going forward! We have designed two types of programs for you — Resource Programs and Development Programs. Our development programs will enable you to enhance your leadership capability and our resource programs will provide you access to solutions and people.
We empower Changemakers to create audacious visions and step up the impact they are having in their communities

Our development programs enhance the leadership capability of the Changemakers and our resource programs give them access to solutions & people.

Please do email us if you are interested in any of these programs at gapcm@head-held-high.org and one of our team members will get in touch with you. Contact Nidhi Raj (Mon-Fri between 10am-5pm) on: +91 8884604881 or email changemakers@head-held-high.org

We look forward to walking with you in your changemaking journey!

To know more about Changemakers 2017, check out the GAP Brochure
Or visit http://globalactiononpoverty.org/
AUTHOR GUIDELINES

The newsletter welcomes articles and commentaries on topics such as social welfare, governance, social policies, social protection, peace, and human security, with focus on South Asia. It encourages scholars and practitioners to write articles from their research work, academic papers, and field experiences. The newsletter strictly follows APA referencing style. It shall be the responsibility of the author(s) to ensure appropriate citations and referencing as per standard referencing rules. The selection of article and commentary would be primarily based on the quality of the manuscript and its relevance to the contemporary subjects and fulfilling the objectives of the newsletter. We request contributors to submit original articles and take due care in aspects such as methodology, theoretical discussion, clearer flow of arguments, and diplomatic language.

For Special Articles
The word limit is between 5000 and 6000 words (including abstract, keywords, and references). The author(s) should submit the article in MS Word format. It should have a cover page specifying aspects like title, author(s) name(s), affiliated institution, communication address, and short bio (of 100 words). Article should have an abstract of not more than 150 words and five keywords. In case of multiple authors, the first author will be considered as the corresponding author. A letter of authorisation from all they authors to agree to the order in which the names appear will have to be submitted along with the article.

For commentaries
The word limit for commentary is between 1000 and 2000 words. The author(s) should submit the article in MS Word format. It should have a cover page specifying aspects like title, author(s) name(s), affiliated institution, communication address, and short bio (of 100 words).

Review system
The manuscript received will be reviewed by the Editor and the Guest Editor. The accepted manuscript may undergo a process to fit within the policy outline of this newsletter. The Editor and the Guest Editor will provide inputs to the author(s) and it is the responsibility of the author(s) to make the necessary corrections. The decision of the Editor will be the final. All the communication will be carried out through e-mail.

Communication
P. K. Shajahan Ph.D
(Editor and Regional President ICSW- South Asia)
Professor and Chairperson
Centre for Community Organization and Development Practice
School of Social Work, Tata Institute of Social Sciences
Deonar, Mumbai – 400 088, India
Mobile: +91 9820565165, E-mail: pkshajahan@icsw.org